CONTENTS

REPORT
Introduction
Processes Adopted
Preliminary Suggestions
  • Acquisition of Aesthetic and Cultural Sensitivity
  • Identification, Sensitization and Training of Teachers
  • Status of Art and Music Schools and Colleges in the country

ANNEXURES
Annexure 1: Minutes of the meeting held on 2.11.2004 at NCERT, New Delhi
Annexure 2: Report of the meeting held on 10.3.2005 at RIE, Mysore
Annexure 3: Report of the meeting held on 23.3.2005 at DSERT, Bangalore
Annexure 4: Minutes of the meeting held on 31.3.2005 at NCERT, New Delhi
Annexure 5: Suggestions from Shri Javed Akhtar, Member
Annexure 6: Suggestions from Ms. Krishna Sobti, Member
Annexure 7: Suggestions from Dr. Kiran Seth, Member
Annexure 8: Members of the Sub-Committee
REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON

INTEGRATION OF CULTURE EDUCATION
IN THE SCHOOL CURRICULUM

Central Advisory Board of Education
Ministry of Human Resource Development, Government of India

Introduction

All of us are concerned about diminishing moral values and the growing intolerance among communities, castes and groups that make up our great nation. What is depressing is the sad reality that spread of education in the country has made no serious difference in this regard. In fact, there are at least some of us who suspect that the perfunctory education provided through our schools may have, to some extent, contributed to this distressing situation.

Our school education relies almost exclusively on predetermined sets of ‘competencies’ to be acquired through rote memorization, thereby denying our children opportunities to exercise their innate thinking capabilities and their individual creativity. Our classroom pedagogy deprives children opportunities to learn in a collaborative, reflective manner that would have at least helped them acquire basic social skills. Our outdated system of examination has contributed to a mad rush for ‘ranks’, ‘seats’ and ‘jobs’…making us wonder whether we have, at some point in time, lost sight of the real objectives of education.

We are bothered about the declining awareness among our children about their own cultural backgrounds. Another cause for concern is the fact that education is looked upon by marginalized sections of the society to get ‘cultured’ in order to ‘get out of the rut’. Literacy, while opening up the entire world to these sections may also alienate them from their basic cultural
strengths. We need to ensure that children from these sections recognize the strengths of their own ethos…and build up on those.

While the term ‘culture’ is universally considered to denote a reflection of the manifestation of civilized living, in India the term has come to be tainted with religious and communal connotations: so much so that there are suggestions that one needs to be cautious while using the term. The word ‘creativity’ or ‘creative arts’ could become more meaningful and relevant, especially when we think of the specific context of the needs of children.

It was in this context that the reconstituted CABE’s Committee of ‘Integration of Culture Education in the School Curriculum’ was given the rather broad mandate: to look into the ‘what’, the ‘why’ and the ‘how’ of inculcating cultural values through the School Curriculum.

The Terms of Reference for the Committee are challenging:

a) To suggest ways of enhancing the quality of cultural awareness among school going children.
b) To suggest ways of introducing both in curricular and extra curricular ways, the learning of our traditional, folk, classical and contemporary art forms
c) To suggest ways of helping the students to appreciate the world of arts, music and literature
d) To suggest ways of introducing a capsule on the appreciation of arts in the curriculum of teacher education
e) To suggest ways of introducing art appreciation as an elective subject in the universities
d) To help understand the status of art and music schools and colleges in the country.
Processes adopted

a) The sub-committee first met in Delhi and discussed the issue of teaching/learning process of culture in schools on 2nd November 2004. See annexure 1

b) Some educationists, writers and theatre activists met in Mysore, RIE and discussed the problems of cultural education broadly. The meeting was held on March 10, 2005. See annexure 2

c) A meeting of painters, musicians, writers and activists involved in primary education were called in Bangalore from 23rd March 2005 to 26th March. See annexure 3

d) Second meeting of the sub committee was held in Delhi, NCERT on March 31, 2005. Summary to be annexed as number 4

e) Some further suggestions received from Shri Javed Akhtar with emphasis on exposing the child to popular arts. These ideas were generated after the second Delhi meet, See annexure 5

f) Some further suggestions on the holistic use of the concept of ‘integration’ in a multi-cultural society by Ms Krishna Sobti. These ideas were generated during the discussion in the second Delhi meet. See annexure 6

g) A detailed account of the integration of culture education in the school and college curriculum. This document was prepared after talking to school and college students, teachers, and parents by the Spic Macay. Dr Kiran Seth one of the members has got this done. See annexure 7

Preliminary suggestions

Acquisition of aesthetic and cultural sensitivity

Since acquisition of aesthetic and cultural sensitivity, picking up awareness about art forms and actually studying them are closely interlinked, at least the first three elements of the ToR could be examined together: viz, (a) enhancing the quality of cultural awareness among children, (b) introducing the learning of our traditional, folk, classical and contemporary art forms. and (c) helping students to appreciate the world of arts, music and literature

It is a sad reality that most of our children do not have sufficient understanding of the strengths of their own cultural backgrounds. Nor are they aware of the cultural backdrop of their friends and acquaintances. What is, perhaps more distressing is the fact that they pick up inaccurate, distorted understanding
leading to complexes, prejudices and intolerance. Our school education does not provide sufficient opportunities to our children to understand either themselves or others. As indicated earlier the ‘chalk and talk’ approach does not give space to children to work in groups, to explore and learn together. If children are encouraged to work in group activities, group projects and so on even in the primary grades, gender and other kinds of biases will never get embedded in their mind. On the other hand, opportunities for imbibing the ability to accept the viewpoints of others, leadership qualities etc will routinely become part of day-to-day school life. The present system does not even allow the learner to reflect on his own: to appreciate the value of solitude either.

If one is to understand culture as being the most civilized relationship between humans, a sensitivity to and understanding of those considered ‘others’ is important. This is the only way of destroying prejudices, which is the beginning of the most uncultured behaviour. Gender sensitivity is something that has to be part of any value system that children should absorb.

Centrally prescribed textbooks tend to provide insufficient flexibility in integrating local resources including local ‘texts’ and culture with the Teaching-Learning process. Inadequately sensitized teachers add to the problem.

But the notion that everything wrong with the school education system (including inadequate infrastructure facilities) should be set right before attempting to inculcate cultural values through the school curriculum is too pessimistic an approach. Many things can be attempted despite the limitations of the existing system

The suggestions for improving the quality of cultural awareness, would therefore include:

- The entire schooling should be based on the culture of the locality / community. Learning should be made ‘culture sensitive’
• The school curriculum should be process based, and experiential, with sufficient flexibility to integrate local culture. The development of the curriculum should be taken up with the involvement of local resources: human and otherwise. The curriculum should have sufficient flexibility to accommodate the hopes, aspirations, needs and culture of the local community. Village Education Committees could be involved in developing the ‘school curriculum’, which could be designed to dovetail with the ‘general’ curriculum.

• The unhealthy and cruel practice of forcibly ‘teaching’ pre-school children has to be prohibited, if necessary through legislation.

• The role of the textbooks and the manner in which they are used needs to be re-defined. The ‘dominant’ nature of the textbook should be toned down. There must be sufficient space for accommodating local art forms, practices, places, institutions, festivals, rituals, artifacts, literature, even local riddles and humour.

• The teaching learning process (and the teachers) should not thrust upon the students the values, beliefs and behaviours of the dominant cultures in such domains as religion and family life which only need to be learned for general awareness and understanding rather than for advocated active use.

• Conscious efforts should be made to ensure that the Teaching-Learning process does not become culturally sterile: consciously or unconsciously promoting one particular culture / sub-culture.

• The teacher should become a friend and facilitator encouraging different cultural patterns and processes. Children enjoy talking about their own lives, their families, what they personally like and dislike and so on. Teachers should be sensitized to encourage children to explore their own as well as alien lifestyles. In Malappuram District in Kerala, a district with a predominant Muslim population, a primary school teacher organized an interesting learning activity: she got the children...
(most of them Muslims) to join together to prepare a ‘Hindu’, vegetarian Onam feast!)

- Different folk art forms, folksongs, stories, riddles, and games, should be included as ‘text’ material. Conscious efforts should be made to ensure that the illustrations in textbooks reflect local culture. Decorations, embellishments in textbooks could use local forms such as local mural paintings, Rangoli, Kolam and others.

- The Teaching-Learning process should make use of a variety of ‘home-tongues’, dialects and other local languages. The Teaching-Learning process should make the best use of the diversity of local challenges. In Kasaragod District in Kerala, teachers face the daunting challenge of teaching children who have Malayalam, Tulu and Kannada as ‘home-tongues’. Ideally the teacher should be recruited from the locality and should be proficient in all the local languages / dialects for facilitating learning. What is relevant from the cultural point of view is that the teacher should be carefully guided to acquire attitudes, understanding and skills for utilizing the cultural and language diversity creatively (through even multi-lingual learning activities including drama, music and so on).

- For the pre-primary and elementary stage of school education the mother tongue shall be the medium of instruction so that children do not feel ‘threatened’ by an alien language thrust upon them. This will ensure that the thinking processes of the child, which happens in the mother / home tongues do not get hindered.

- The ‘terrain of culture’ should have sufficient free space for all local languages and dialects.

- The school PTAs and Village Education Committees could be encouraged to get actively involved in providing support to teachers for accessing and utilizing local ‘cultural’ resources both human and material. A small cultural museum could be set
up in each Gram Panchayath displaying local art and artifacts. Visits to these museums should be built into the school curriculum itself.

- The school calendar should have at least two periods a week set apart exclusively for cultural activities. Local artists, musicians, painters, writers and storytellers could be guests and performers at some of these sessions. Children should be encouraged to directly interact with them.

- Each school should have a good library and use of the library should be made an integral part of the school curriculum. In the primary schools at least one teacher should be provided training to maintain the library in a meaningful manner. In the secondary grades a professionally trained librarian should be appointed.

- The school library should be the nodal point for all ‘cultural’ learning in the school. Every school library should have a carefully selected collection of literature and reference books. The school library should also have a collection of ‘renowned’ paintings, music, and so on. All teachers should be sensitized so that they can help children get gradually acquainted with the masters and their masterpieces.

- Every teacher should be trained to utilize collections of local folk stories, folk songs and folk ‘knowledge’ as part of the Teaching-Learning process.

- Children should be encouraged to collectively and individually explore activities such as cooking, gardening, stitching, bird watching and even video and still photography.

- In the elementary grades, every child should be given opportunities to participate in activities including singing, dancing, developing stories from pictures, role play, amateur dramatics and so on. Thus children would get ample opportunities to practice music, drawing, dramatics and so on in a non-threatening atmosphere as part of the regular Teaching-Learning process.
• At the Upper Primary stage, teachers could gradually introduce children to the nuances of the ‘general’ grammar of art forms (concepts such as rhythm, movement, melody, balance, harmony, general principles of drawing, painting and so on) and also organize direct exposure to these art forms. Even at the Upper Primary stage children should not be taught art in the usual manner…. for instance music should not be taught through ragas at this stage.

• Exposure could be through panels of local or other artists at the district, Panchayat and school level. Talented local storytellers and writers could be invited to visit schools. Possibility of using audio / video / multimedia could be explored in this regard.

• National and State-level bodies such as the Sahithya Academy and Sangeeth Natak Academy could be advised to provide assistance to the school education system in terms of providing resource support.

• By the Upper Primary stage children could be encouraged to get involved in creative dramatics in a much more ‘technical’ manner. The school theatre could be used for getting children to imbibe and practice the elements of theatre: script writing, stage-setting, costume making and so on. Theatre has substantial potential in education. It is heartening to learn that some effort is already going on in this area. In Mysore, Nataka Rangayana has already started this and is training teachers in the area. The programme attempts to sensitize teachers about theatre and its possibilities. ‘Theatre in Education’ should be a compulsory subject in training institutes for DEd and BEd.

• The mechanical manner in which “Drill” teachers impart physical ‘education’ should be stopped. Yoga and other local traditional physical activities (Kalari, for instance, in Kerala) should be used instead.

• Children’s camps could be organized during vacations where ‘cultural’ activities could be freely explored in a non-threatening
atmosphere. As indicated earlier, the school library could be the nodal point for ‘cultural’ activities including exposure to traditional, folk, classical and contemporary art forms.

- All the above-mentioned experiences should be carefully integrated into the school curriculum so that ALL children get to participate in them at least through the Upper Primary stage. This will ensure that all children get sufficient opportunities to explore their creativity and discover hidden talents.

- The system of assessment of learning should be modified so that the ‘quality’ of participation in these activities is adequately rewarded. Traits such as aesthetic sensitivity, leadership qualities, talent etc. should also be appropriately recognized.

- Children should be encouraged, right from the elementary stage, to critically evaluate the content of Television and films and so on so that they become discerning in their choice of programmes to be viewed. This approach could be extended to cover areas such as media-sensitivity and so on.

- The present Youth Festivals where children artificially ‘study’ certain snippets of art forms for extra marks (and glory) without understanding the basic philosophy behind the art form are to be totally prohibited.

- At the Secondary stage, talented children (identified at the elementary and Upper Primary stage of schooling) should be given the option to choose an art form for more detailed study, if necessary, giving up one of the regular academic subjects. At this stage professional artists and artisans should be used as teachers.

- The present teacher-exchange programmes should be substantially enhanced qualitatively.

- Exchange of groups / troupes of performers from other districts and even other states should be organized so that children (and teachers) get direct opportunities for learning the nuances of these art forms and the differences. It should be made possible
for children to realize that there are other ways of speaking. They should get opportunities for understanding the others’ dance patterns, their singing patterns, their performances and also their ways of socializing, negotiating and so on. This would help in enhancing the students’ skill to ‘appreciate’ others.

- The government and government-aided schools should be empowered in every possible manner. A new ‘Common School System’ should be designed and implemented, one that would bridge the cultural barriers by bringing all students together irrespective of caste, creed, location or sex, to have access to education of comparable quality. This would be one important approach to the integration of cultural values into school education.

**Identification, sensitization and training of teachers**

The identification, sensitization and training of teachers for undertaking school activities of the nature suggested above are extremely challenging. The present system of recruitment of teachers, based purely on the marks scored in qualifying examinations, is to be discarded. Modern processes for identifying capabilities of potential teachers should be adopted. A teacher-candidate with average academic qualifications but with proven aptitude and talents should be given an advantage over a ‘brilliant’ candidate who has inadequate commitment and talent.

The BEd and DEd courses in the various states in the country are badly outdated both in content and methodology. Nor do these courses provide much in terms of equipping teachers to undertake meaningful ‘culture-friendly’ school activities. Both BEd and DEd courses should have specific modules for art appreciation. *Every* student-teacher should be given opportunities to specialize in at least one of the creative arts. Excellence in these should be adequately recognized. Resource Persons for these pre-service courses should
necessarily include panels of carefully identified artists, musicians, painters and practitioners of the other creative art forms.

Some states – Karnataka for instance – do have music / drama / drawing / dance components as part of the DEd syllabus. But these institutions do not have professionals to teach them. These performing arts are taught theoretically by the ‘subject teachers’ and that too in a perfunctory manner. Every such institution should have at least one qualified teacher for at least a few of the creative art subjects.

Once identified and recruited, it is the responsibility of the system to provide continuous support to teachers to constantly enhance their attitude, understanding and skills enabling them to respond to the varying challenges of the school reality. Teachers need to be provided frequent and intensive in-service training, (adopting content and methodology that are in tune with the professed school pedagogy). Here again artists, musicians, painters and so on should be compulsorily engaged as Resource Persons at the in-service training programmes.

It is also necessary to set up adequate structures and systems so that teachers’ performance is closely monitored and evaluated. The mandate and capability of the Block Resource Centres and Cluster Resource Centres should be adequately enhanced. The funds available under the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan Project should be imaginatively used for this. Teachers need to be provided with continuous support so that they gradually turn into committed professionals.
Status of art and music schools and colleges in the country

“Art and music schools and colleges” in the country vary substantially in form and quality. There are government run institutions that provide mediocre art education with certain rare exceptions. There are commercially run institutions that mechanically produce ‘performers’. It is felt that a detailed survey should be taken up separately to look into these institutions and for suggesting ways of improving their effectiveness.

What is suggested is that the courses should be carefully designed in such a manner that students also get regular academic training. The ‘equivalence’ of such qualifications also needs to be carefully reconsidered so that students are not denied job opportunities merely because they had opted for such courses.

****

U.R. Ananthamurthy,
Chairman
ANNEXURES
Annexure 1

Minutes of the Meeting of the Sub-Committee of CABE on the subject of “Integration of Culture Education in the School Curriculum” held on 2.11.2004 in the Conference Room, Zakir Hussain Block, First Floor, NCERT

The first meeting of the sub-committee of CABE on the above subject was held on 2.11.2004. The following members attended the meeting:

1. Prof. U R Ananthamurthy
   Chairperson
   498 Suragi, HIG House
   RMV Ilnd Stage, 6th A Main
   Bangalore - 560 094

2. Dr. Vinod Raina
   Member
   Chairman, Arena Council of Fellows
   E1/193, ARERA Colony
   Bhopal - 462 016

3. Dr. Kiran Seth
   - do -
   Associate Professor
   Production & Industrial Engg.
   IIT, Delhi

4. Shri S.K. Maheshwari
   - do -
   Additional Secretary, School Education
   Government of Uttranchal
   Uttranchal Secretariat
   4, Subhash Road
   Dehradun-248001

5. Dr. A. Panneer Selvam
   - do -
   Special Secretary, School Education
   Government of Tamil Nadu
   Secretariat, Fort St. George
   Chennai- 600009

6. Dr. S. Chellappa
   - do -
   Principal Secretary, School Education
   Government of Andhra Pradesh
   J- Block, AP Secretariat
   Hyderabad
   Andhra Pradesh

7. Prof. Krishna Kumar
   Member Secretary
   Director
   NCERT
Prof. Krishna Kumar, Director, NCERT as the Member Secretary of the Sub-Committee welcomed all the members. He drew the attention of the members to the neglect of cultural component of education in the formal school system, although all the policy documents developed so far had been strongly emphasising this aspect. As a result, there is lack of appreciation for the world of arts, music and literature in students and community at large. The Director pointed out that broad parameters given by the MHRD for introducing culture education in the school education and teacher education curriculum need to be discussed and the agenda for this sub-committee needs to be evolved. The committee is expected to submit the interim report within two months time and the final report will be brought out in six months which will be based on the review of existing culture education related practices and the opinions of experts in this area. The Director also informed the group that Bharat Bhawan, an NGO based in Bhopal, had organised a national level conference on culture education. The report of the conference will be procured by NCERT and made available to the members in due course.

During the ensuing discussion, it was felt that even in the states which have rich traditions of art and culture, these do not get reflected in the daily activities of the schools. Students do not have healthy reading habits. Most of the schools all over the country do not have a proper library and the books are kept locked in the cupboards. It was suggested that the library could also be used for listening to music and to see films which are related to the school subjects. Since the students watch a lot of television programmes, opportunities should be provided to discuss these programmes with them during school hours. Activities like yoga and dance could also be integrated with the school curriculum.

The terms of reference of the committee focus on development of awareness, appreciation and skills related to art and culture. Introducing art as a subject therefore would not serve this purpose. Since the diversity of culture and values which are inherent in the communication, food, livelihood, environment etc. need to be reflected upon, different types of teaching-learning strategies need to be used in transacting the curriculum. For instance, even a festival like Diwali is celebrated differently all over the country. This kind of awareness regarding diversity of cultures should be generated among the children through inclusion of relevant contents in the textbooks as well as teaching-learning strategies.

The members expressed their concern over lack of common school system which has led to segregation of different sections of society and
domination of the upward mobile classes, their culture and value systems. Some of the members expressed that due to financial crunch, the libraries could not be maintained properly. In this context, it was pointed out that one needs to look into the historical and social conditions which led to the conception of schools without libraries and inputs on local art and culture. It was stated that the reflection of culture in the school system is dependent on its linkages with achievement and success. For instance, the various dance forms which are becoming popular as a hobby and source of easy money elsewhere are dying out in Tamil Nadu.

Some of the members mentioned that financial problems and teacher absenteeism have also created problems for proper transaction of the curriculum. The culture of the school and the culture at home are wide apart. Besides, there are competitions and fairs to encourage learning of science and sports but not art and culture.

It was agreed that the issue is deep, complex and structural issues are involved. The language and religion are the carriers of culture. All the cultures including minority and tribal cultures should find representations in the education system. Religion is an issue on which the country has faced difficult times. The schools are facing communal problems. Even the morning prayers could not be organised in schools due to communal tensions. The Chairman informed the committee about the series of books brought out by the NBT on various religions which could be examined for their relevance to the school curriculum.

In order to develop appreciation for culture and manage issues relating to respect for plurality, it is important that strong foundations may be laid down in the educational policy itself on the depiction of culture in the textbooks and teaching-learning processes. Development of cultural awareness and appreciation-related skills has implications for the way the textbooks are developed and the way teachers respond to such issues. In this context, it was suggested that members from Boards of School Education, NCTE, CBSE, ICSE, Textbook Bureaus/Corporations, UGC etc. may be co-opted. It was also mentioned during discussion that the three language formula which was suggested in the curriculum has not been successful in persuading children to learn Indian languages other than their mother tongue. The students are opting for mother tongue, English and the third language chosen by them is mostly a foreign language like French, Russian etc. At this stage, the Director, NCERT informed that the review of curriculum framework will be taken up from the point of view of culture education and Steering Committees will be set up to examine various aspects. One of them will focus on art, music, dance etc. Discussion also centred on the need for secretarial assistance for the work of the committee. The committee must organise about 2-3 meetings involving people from different linguistic regions.

Director, NCERT also informed that the MHRD has planned 4 lakhs for the work of the committee which is not sufficient for the whole group to travel to different regions. The Additional Secretary, MHRD will be requested to sanction additional funds for holding nationwide meetings. Discussion was
also held on the possibilities of inviting suggestions from public on the issue through print and electronic media, however, the group decided that a brief note may be developed and circulated to eminent persons in the central and state level academies dealing with fine arts. A letter will be drafted which will be sent to Lalit Kala Academi, Sahitya Akademi, Sangeet Natak Akademi and state level Academies for inviting suggestions on implementation of culture education in the school curriculum. The Chairman also suggested that the NBT may be requested to hold a General Body Meeting to discuss the issue and send their suggestions.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair and the members of the Committee.

**Major Decisions Taken**

i. An interim report will be submitted after two to three months. Final report based on comprehensive review of culture education related practices and deliberations with the experts will be brought out after six months.

ii. Members from Boards of School Education, NCTE, CBSE, ICSE, Textbook Bureaus/Corporations, UGC etc. may be co-opted since generating cultural awareness has linkages with the way textbooks are developed and the way teaching-learning proceeds at different stages of education.

iii. The series of books brought out by NBT on various religions should be procured and examined for their relevance to the school curriculum.

iv. Two or three members of the committee would travel to different parts of the country, will hold meetings with different regional/linguistic groups and prepare a report for the committee.

v. Secretarial assistance will be provided to the Chairperson.

vi. A letter will be drafted by the NCERT on behalf of the Chairman for inviting suggestions from Lalit Kala Academy, Sangeet Natak Academy, Sahitya Academy and Academies at the state level.

vii. A brief note will be developed by Prof. Vinod Raina for circulation among the centre and state level academics dealing with fine arts to invite their suggestions on the issue of integration of culture to the curriculum.

viii. The report on National Conference on Culture Education organised by Bharat Bhawan, an NGO based in Bhopal, will be procured by the NCERT and made available to the members of the committee.
ix. The NBT will be requested to hold a general body meeting to discuss the issue of integrating culture education with the school curriculum and send their suggestions.

x. The report relating to the textbook analysis for environmental education may be procured from Centre for Environment Education, Thaltej Tehra, Ahmedabad or Director, BVIEER, Pune and circulated to the members of the committee.

xi. The Additional Secretary, MHRD will be requested to sanction additional funds for holding nationwide meetings.

**********
A Report on the First Meeting on Culture and Education held at RIE, Mysore on the 10th March, 2005

Mr N S Raghunath and Mr G Ravindra briefly welcomed the members and left the floor for the Chairman, U.R. Ananthamurthy. The Chairman made the following remarks to set the ball rolling:

Prof Ananthamurthy : Central Advisory Board for Education has been in existence in India since 1920. The previous government did not reconstitute the CABE. As soon as Mr. Arjun Singh assumed office in the present government, it was reconstituted. Education ministers of all states, their secretaries, Central Educational Institutions like NCERT along with 32 artists, philosophers, thinkers -constitute this Board. The MHRD takes decision on educational policies after a free discussion with the Board members because it's an all India body. We met for two days and had a fruitful discussion on various aspects of Education. Several committees were constituted by the CABE in order to formulate national policy. The NCERT Director, Prof Krishna Kumar, is the Member Secretary of the Committees. The issues connected with Culture and Education, the what, the why and the how of inculcating the cultural values in the School Curriculum will be discussed by this Committee. A few propositions have already been outlined:

Common Schools, where children of all class of people go, have now been closed for lack of students. For instance, in Kerala, the teachers are paid their salary as protected teachers. The reason given for the fall in admission to these schools is decline in population. The real reason, however, is not the decrease in population as has been made out to be, but parents of all classes want their children to have knowledge of English and therefore they opt for private schools, however bad they might be. Even families with moderate income would like to send their children to private schools so that they learn English, no matter what the standard is. Students learn virtually nothing in these schools but still parents prefer to send them there. There are good schools as well. But they have very expensive fee structure; it could be one lakh per year. No ordinary middle class parents can ever afford to educate
their children in these schools. Education thus remains discriminatory in our
society. M T Vasudevan Nair once told me that he is a writer today because
he went to a common school. We must strengthen these schools.

1. The students of common school have the attitude to mix with students
of all classes. They have an open mind, are creative and develop a
secular and tolerant outlook in these schools.

2. The medium of instruction is the regional language. English will be
introduced as a subject and not as a medium.

3. Good teachers are always in common schools.

4. The decline of the common schools, I consider, is a great disaster in
the country’s Education system.

What we mean by strengthening the common school is all subjects in
these schools should be taught in the local language of the region where
these schools are located. Learning, then, would not only be deep and
intense, but also help develop a strong cognitive system. English should be
taught well as a language but should not be used as medium of instruction.
But then they should also be able to go to higher studies; when the moment
comes to shift to English medium, it makes the transition smooth. They should
not have a situation where they are denied the facilities (exposure,
opportunities and advantages) which the upper class students get in private
schools; those are the things which are connected with culture. An Important
point must be made here. When we define culture; do we define it as Mathew
Arnold or Raymond Williams did? I mention these names because they are
familiar ones. If we define culture as Mathew Arnold or D V Gundappa did,
culture means the best the mind gets at the higher level. What is that higher
level will be decided by those who have come to higher level. Therefore it is
not possible to fix which one is of higher level for ever Time to time it might
change depending upon who comes to higher level. It, then, is not going to be
the truth for all time to come. But that was Arnoldian way of defining.
But a healthy way of thinking about culture is, that there is a culture at whatever level one lives. It is related to the situations in day to day life. It may be the songs they sing, the plays they stage, or may be the festive celebrations or their customs; the tribal people have their own culture. First of all, there is a belief that the moment we start sending our children to school, they will forget all our oral tradition. They lose quite a few things through literacy in the same manner as we gain through it. But we always make an attempt to see that whatever we lose is not lost. So there is an effort made to regain it in some form or the other. The same way, probably, when we begin to go about teaching culture, we begin to impose on children what we think is great. Children coming from different kind of culture might develop inferiority complex here. We should never allow our children to feel whatever the rituals and customs they practice at home is inferior or is of cruder level and that the teacher is going to give something very superior. If that happens, we are going to kill a lot of variety that exists in our country. We must go about in such a way where the variety is not lost, and they don't lose the existing one through literacy and become alienated from their parents. We don't want our education to lead to any kind of break up in value system that might have been there. We want a healthy society where the family ties and relationship remain in tact. We now must think of what to teach and how to teach and what is the right approach to educate them.

Drawing from his school experience Dr Anmanthamurthy traced three virtues of a good teacher as his ability to sing, to draw and to act. Such teacher would become the darling of students. He then touched upon teacher training programme. When we think of culture and education, we should think at two levels: That is

1. **What to teach**
2. **How to train teachers:**
   a) What should they be trained in?
   b) What should be the content of cultural training?
   c) Should it be different in different areas according to the cultural background?
d) But education is also about acquiring new things, exposing children to new cultural areas; it means enriching what the children know and enriching the existing culture around them. We should not take a view that those who are born to a specific culture should be kept imprisoned only in that culture. Our education should not devalue it but at the same time education must help them to acquire something new and different. We must see that a liberal, secular and tolerant culture is inculcated in them.

**The Views of the Participants**

**Prof. Srinivasan** (Retired Professor of Science)

What should be our Education System after independence has been dominantly bothering us. Education should be to "Prepare a complete man" as Vivekananda says, Mathematics for intelligence, Music for the soul and Physical exercise for the body.

Today we have language problem in the primary and secondary level. There is a stress on the regional language. I tend to think the regional languages or the mother tongue should get importance till about 12th Standard. But more importance should be given to Kannada in Karnataka. Learning language is one thing but medium of instruction is another thing.

We must teach the History of our Country in a very simple way. This is culturally very important. We must also teach them Science. We have accepted that every child born in this country should get free education till he/she becomes 14. But private schools are increasing. We are transferring this responsibility to elitist schools which are expensive. There must be a Government School in every village to which all caste and class of students go and dine together. School is also a cultural institute which can change not only the child but the entire family.

**Professor G H Nayak** (An Eminent Literary Critic)

The concept of nation is new to us. Unity in diversity was a political slogan made for political convenience. The concept of culture is vague and confusing. In this sub-continent the nature of politics was different. Secular and democratic concepts were working but the concept of a nation was
fragmented. And therefore the idea of patriotism. Today we are one nation and have one Constitution. When we talk about culture, too much stress on the past is wrong. We have the responsibility of preventing children from developing inferiority complex, as Ananthamurthy says. It is very important. It happens because we have superior culture or inferior culture. Mathew Arnold was cited in this respect. When we talked about culture in the past, we glorified out past because we had nothing else to talk about. Today it is different. It is not enough if we give the past as history, we have to think how relevant that history is to contemporary times. It's not that it shouldn't be given, but the question is how meaningful it is and we should have a clear idea about what should be given and what kind of culture and civilization are we going to build. It should be in keeping with what we have said in the Constitution -equality, liberty, fraternity etc. We have to talk within this framework. If we leave this, it would be meaningless. What we give has to realize and translate in the realistic situation. The former HRD Minister said "Pandit and Mulas will write history hereafter". It's a dangerous deviation. And there is another problem. There is an attempt to equate language with religion. They two are different. Language has a secular dimension. We are not telling this one to our children.

At this stage Ananthamurthy asked for practical suggestion: In Kannada we have Vacanas, devotional songs, proverbs, Sarvanjna, folk literature, as our cultural wealth. We have music in Hindu, Muslum and Christian religions. How much of it can we make available for children and in a secular way? What are the values that we inculcate through this? I need it in - Concrete terms. (These questions are relevant for the current meeting as well. When you speak, please keep this one in mind. We are looking for concrete suggestions). Please tell us what to teach, how to teach and how to manage these things.

**Lingadevaru Halemane** (Linguist and Playwright)

Most of the texts we saw were elite oriented or urban oriented. There is a disparity. We should teach them culture of tolerance: tolerant to other gender, other castes, other religion and others right to speech. Another concept that can be considered is theatre in education. In Mysore, Nataka
Karnataka Rangayana has already started this and is training teachers in this area. Mr Raghunath is also involved in it. It will sensitize teachers about theatre and its possibilities. Theatre is a secular and democratic institute. It's of composite and multidimensional nature. There are so many cultural practices which we are trying to introduce. Of late people have started showing interest in *Kamsale* (a folk dance done to the rhythm of the beating of cymbals), Kolata *Dollu Kunita* (rhythmic dancing to the beating of huge drums), and *Tamate Badita* (beating of flat kind of drum). Youngsters in urban areas are showing interest in learning it these days. These arts are very important cultural practices which are lost under the burden of classical art forms. Introduce 'Theatre in Education' as a subject in training institutes for DEd and BEd. We had an interaction with one of the Joint Directors of the state in this regard where we said these arts should be included in the curriculum so that they could be included in the textbooks. He said he would impress upon the textbook writers at SCERTs but the very same gentleman, later cancelled 15 posts connected with these arts.

**Prof Udaynarayan Singh** (Linguist, Poet and Director, CIIL, Mysore)

In the same way it is necessary to develop three skills in students speaking specifically in the context of inculcating cultural values -these three skills I would call them,

1. Skill to appreciate
2. Skill to criticize or critical skill
3. Skill to perform

Elaborating on the three points, he said, it's very essential to appreciate the other: Under that we can expose them to other cultures. What could be the effect of that syllabus, then? Most of our educated people are absolutely unaware of the linguistic scenario we have in this country. They have no idea what languages are spoken, what variety is like? We have seen what civilizations have done to New Zealand, Australia, Canada and USA. From 300 languages in USA, it has reduced to just 24 now. In Canada from 211 languages only 6 are surviving now. Over the centuries the western education and 'civilization' hasn't really created more educated individuals among them. They have destroyed whatever the variety and diversity that existed. We shouldn't be following that model. It's essential that in the school curriculum,
we need to tell them what this diversity is. It is something like what Ganesh has done to the tribals: you just hear the folk songs, their performances. It's important for them to realize that there are other ways of speaking. It's for them to understand the others dance patterns, their singing patterns, their performances, also their ways of socializing, negotiating or other modes of signification. This is what I would call skill to appreciate. This could be inculcated. One can think how exactly lessons could be built around these areas.

Secondly, the critical skill: It's essential that they don't bask in the glory of 'hail mother land','jai Karnataka', 'Tamils are the best' etc. They should examine critically what is wrong with themselves, what is to be changed. A lot our thinkers who have brought in changes, have done that. Bankim Chandra or Ramanuja, they received English education but they went into the mode of critical self. We need to make them take a re-look at history. We need to tell them what we are telling you are not the final truth.

The skill to perform: This is a special skill. Even the university graduates with PhDs don't know how to perform. They have good ideas in their subject but don't know how to perform in different domains, play different roles, deal with group specific issues, gender specific issues they must be trained in.

Dr. L. Basavaraju (Professor of Kannada, an Eminent Scholar)

The question is how to redeem our children. There are large numbers of villages and small number of towns in this country. But the small numbers are doing damages to villages. If you look at the sheer number of people in the villages, it is overwhelming. They are the real citizens of this country. The question of how to redeem them is hidden in this problem. All the activities happening here are limited to big cities and towns, and even the medium of instruction is English, I understand. It means a very large number of students have remained outside the domain of what is happening here. What language do you use to prepare textbooks for these children? What language do you use to teach them? There are Dalits, the hill tribes and so on. Are you able to create the psychological condition for them to learn what is taught? They have
their own creative potential. Can you develop it? What kind of residential school should be established for them? You need to prepare books in the folk style. How do you prepare teachers and set up residential school where they can teach and look after them with concern and affection. It may not be possible to do it till the 12th standard but up to 10th standard it must be done.

Dr Ananthamurthy intervened at this point and taking example of a young girl of the neighbouring village who is not literate, he said, for her Upendra is the hero. He pointed out how the labour class children are capable of developing their own sense of critical skill. And another girl who is going to school has developed such excellent skill in reading. She narrated the story of Ekalavya. She said that a prince should get all the good education and not an ordinary boy. She narrated the story in every minute detail saying how the dog was killed and how Arjuna was annoyed because an ordinary boy was better than him. And how, Drona took his thumb. Then I asked her, said Dr Murthy, what she felt about it? She asked me wasn't it wrong, sir? Dronacharya being a great saint should he do that? Saints also commit mistakes, sir, don't they? Our children are growing in the age of democracy. They have a sense of judgment. The teachers teach what is given in the curriculum, but there is no provision in the curriculum to develop their mental power. There is some kind of cultural dissemination among the young through certain media today. Sometimes it's loud and vulgar, according to me. According to them there is variety and as a teacher should be able to deal with it. For example, if you are narrating the story of Ekalavya how do you narrate it? Which are the modern writers you are going to use? In what way do you plan to develop their mind? They have their own customs. The girl participated in the Sivarathri festival, in the evening and sang songs. She is part of that world also.

At this point Mrs Meera Nayak said that we have Muslims and Christians as well. We must bring in their customs and festivals too.

Dr Murthy: That is what I am saying. If we should bring these values into the classroom of these mixed schools, how should we do it? All Dharmas should find place in the school curriculum. Is it possible to do it without compromising and without giving a chance to develop inferiority complex in
anyone? What should be the curriculum now? This is a practical question. That is why we are discussing it.

There are arguments that don't touch culture at all. Leave it alone. Teach them only life skills. Don't bring music, dance. If we should take a decision on it, we have to keep in mind all these things. We need to face this. The complications Mrs Meera Nayak mentioned should be taken into account when we discuss it.

**Dr. L Basavaraju:** In every village there should be central government school. If not there should be residential one such school in every taluk. Well trained teachers should be teaching the textbooks prepared by you people should be teaching in these schools.

**URA:** I attempted to tell the Govt. to start model school like Kuvempu model school. The Chief Minister said that he would do it for rural children. I didn't want it for village children alone. I wanted all students to go to that school. Separate schools for rural children and urban children.

**G H Nayak:** The philosophy behind the common school is in the Constitution, the kind of culture and civilization we want to build. The private schools are going beyond this in teaching language and employing the medium of instruction. Can't there be a common syllabus for them and the government should play a role in it. Aren't they trying to sabotage the Constitutional intentions?

**URA:** It's a question that is bothering me too much. In the 2-day C ABE meeting a retired director of IIT told the meeting to my great surprise that when we used to get students from the common schools, the quality of the mind was very high. Today I get most of my students from very special schools, they do extremely well in tests but they are not good as IIT students. It surprised me. In the common schools they attend classes with all castes and religious children. There is a quality which is not found in the students of special schools.
In common schools from which they come in villages, they sit with all caste and class of children. They learn together. If they become intelligent and go to higher learning, there is a quality which is not found in children educated only in special schools. There was even a mention to reserve a few seats in IITs for children coming from common schools.

**Smt. Gayatri Devi Dutt:** Instead of keeping seats reserved, why not conduct test on the subject learnt in the common schools?

**URA:** Yes, good suggestion. If higher places are available for these children, we can also send our children to schools. When a sector is privatised, public sector becomes useless. Health is a good example. Govt hospitals become no good. It looks as though the officials privatize sectors to make Government functioning difficult. If we teach cultural values also in these schools, they will acquire skill to appreciate, skill to perform and critical skill will develop. In fact, rural children have better skills to perform.

**GHN:** In common schools we perform Ganesh Pooja, Saraswati Pooja. What about other religious functions?

**L. Basavaraju:** Muslims and Christians don’t do idol worship.

**Lingadevaru:** These days which ever religion dominates in the area, they open the schools. In common schools, there will hardly be any Christian or Muslim children. Cultural activities will be dominated by the dominant group.

**URA:** In a common school in Tumkur I visited recently, the prayer they sang was

(Original version in Kannada here)
You reach everybody
According to their own vision
In their own form.

I was moved by that prayer. It’s a great thing that we have a prayer in Kannada, like that the prayer we sang was.

(Original version in Kannada here)

O Lord, the ruler of the Universe

I salute you, I salute you.

In Kerala they do silent prayer. In England where I was teaching a Muslim boy objected to do Christian prayer. He was allowed to do his prayer after negotiations with the higher authorities. In a huge country like India, this is bound to occur. That is why some argue; don't teach cultural values in schools.

GHN: Yes, it must be left out.

Meera: In all schools (Original version in Kannada here) is sung first.

Hail to you Mother Karnataka.

You are daughter of Bharath Mata.

Then they sing the National Anthem.

URA: There are objection to calling the land Mother by some religions.

Prof. Srinivasan: Everybody should be allowed to his/her own Prayer. If you accept prayers or else give it up completely.

When the temperature of the debate become hot, the Chairman said it will be decided at the all India level. But then, he said, he would like to make an observation. Most cultural values we know, particularly Indian music, is deeply religious, and dance is very deeply religious. It is not communal but religious. Therefore, when we take a decision we must discriminate between the spiritual and the communal.
Kikkeri Narayan (Linguist and worked on Tribal Culture and Languages)

He shared his experience; he had had with the tribal community for 30 years. In 1974 when I started working on tribal community, there were Kannada books. They were taught in the primary schools. I sat there for Six days. No child spoke in the classroom. Seventh day I took them to forest. They were so talkative; they were using their local knowledge system. You will be surprised to know that a 7 year old child knows how to escape from an elephant. It is a unique knowledge the tribals have. They know which fruit to eat and which one not to eat. I have written a play (Original version in Kannada here) The Kittale Creeper. They are staging it now. They don't speak in the classroom probably because the textbooks prescribed to them are completely alien to them. They had not seen a Policeman. Then I decided that the textbooks should be in their own language. I recorded their conversation.

The teachers too would create inferiority complex in them. Take for example (Original version in Kannada here) the child would say (Original version in Kannada here). The teacher would condemn him. The child would rather not speak. I had to train the teachers that there is not superior or inferior culture, it could only be different. Even in language it is true. It is in the culture. 30 teachers were trained in this programme. I prepared a textbook in their language and started my experiment. The changes were dramatic. Children started teaching the teachers. In the experiment school, the minimum Marks scored was 60 and the maximum 92. In the normal school maximum was 40. There were many dropouts before, Out of 24 only 16 were attending. After these books were introduced, they all started attending the school. I wrote books in their language.

Firstly, I used their own vocabulary.
Secondly, similar words but slightly different Kannada words were used.
Thirdly, I used unknown Kannada words.
Then I graded them all. Skills of reading and writing were combined with the content.
In the first standard book 80% words of their own language was used
Second standard 60 % words of their own language was used
Third standard 40% words of their own language was used
Fourth standard, the class could use any in tribal language.

Even the content wise, the books were graded. First known objects, then, half known, then completely unknown objects.

When the DPI came to test them, she asked the children to read from the Kannada Daily, Prajavani. They read it easily. At the end of day, she wrote a 4 page report in which she said their achievement is better than any convent school children. But the Education Department stopped their scholarship saying they are not using our syllabus and therefore they can't be given scholarship. I met the authorities but it did not help. I had to come back to the old ones.

I wrote plays in their language. We staged those plays all over Karnataka. Actors were born in that language. DD relayed them. Mr. Raghunath included one of my plays 'Kittale Balli' in his book 'Century of Children Literature' Published by Karnataka Sahithya Academy. I collected 9 volumes of folk literature gradually.

**Prof. Umesh** (Professor of Kannada, Theatre Personality)

**Pre-service Training:**

DEd syllabus of Kamataka state has Music/Drama/Drawing/Dance components as part in it. But DEd Institutions do not have trained teachers to teach them. These performing arts are taught theoretically by the 'subject teachers' and they have become a 'token'. So, every training institution should appoint a qualified teacher in any one form of art listed above.

BEd syllabus doesn't have underlining of cultural values. This should become a part of this course also. And this has to be taught by qualified teachers.

According to NCTE norms, every training Institute should have a teacher to teach Music/Drama/Drawing/Dance etc. But these teachers can be appointed on ad hoc basis. This has led the institutions to take these norms
very lightly and many institutes have not appointed art/craft teachers. Norms of NCTE must be made more rigid, effective and properly monitored.

Practicum of DEd and BED should have cultural analysis of content like Pedagogical and Task analysis. By this, it is possible to sensitize the school subject teachers towards cultural values. This should make the teacher to conceive and communicate his subject in a holistic approach.

Every DEd/BEd institute should become a specialized center of one of the art forms - Music/Drama/Drawing/Dance etc so that it would be possible to integrate creative approach and methodologies of these art forms with the school subjects. This would make the teaching more meaningful. This also opens up wide paths of opportunities for the entrants for DEd / BEd at the time of opting intuitions in accordance to their aptitude.

**In-service Training:**

Intensive training programmes for teachers to sensitize them towards culture has to be drawn. Some strategies has to be developed to rope in Fine Arts Institutions / Academics/Cultural centers for this reason.

**Enrichment of School Resources:**

- Like the Black Board Operation, an action plan for 'Cultural Kit Operation' should be drawn.
- Schools should be equipped with an auditorium in a phased manner.
- Schools should be equipped with at least minimum cultural equipments -Tabla, Harmonium, Tala, Make-up Kit, etc.

**Mr. Lawrence Surendra**

He talked about his experience with the tribals of Koraput District of Orissa. Language is a critical marker of several subjects. Culture is also a matter of Citizenship. Dr. Murali Manohar Joshi approached it as citizen's problem.

Culture as power

Culture as respect
Culture as interdependence

UNESCO Director General says India is an example of cultural interdependence.

There is a model in Sweden. If you want to take any grant for theatre activity you have got to be attached to a school or else they would not get any grant. Our Governments should bring this one into practice.

**Chidamara Rao Jambe (Well-known Theatre Man and Director of Rangayana, a Theatre Repertory in Karnataka)**

1. Today Education is becoming an agency supply goods for what the market of the modern day requires.

2. It's also a kind of factory to prepare children for fat salaried jobs.

3. Our city centered education is being imposed on our villages. We have an education system which doesn't even think what the requirements of our children in villages are.

4. In secondary school education we must give serious stress on cultural education. We can't afford to neglect local knowledge. We must pay more attention to it. It's a tragedy, we are neglecting it. Take for example the local medicinal plants or delicate handy craft arts. We have totally ignored them in our education. This kind of knowledge should come into the mainstream of knowledge.

5. We must also revive the art of story telling.

6. The physical education training is very mechanical. Instead, if we teach Kolata, it teaches a sense of rhythm, there is singing in it, dancing to the tune with others, there is give and take with others. It can come to the mainstream of education. Everything need not come from the West.
U.R. Ananthamurthy: A lot of cultural values can be brought in through physical education.

Jambe: Invite the local experts like Bhagvatas for story telling, folk artists for dance and music. We must build initial education and personality through this. Later they can learn anything they want.

U.R. Ananthamurthy: Yagasans can be integrated with dance.
Jambe: By story telling we can increase their vocabulary, trigger their imagination.
U. R. Ananthamurthy: Story telling skill can be included in the curriculum.
Jambe: We are making efforts to shut up their mouths in our education. They play cassettes in a dance programme, they don't make them sing. There is no opportunity for the children to sing in our education system. If the education system does not give cultural values, the students can turn into criminals, I am afraid. It does not help developing our language, culture progressing nation building process.

Janardhan:

1. We have gone too far in the name of culture that it's necessary to come back or else we may ruin our culture.
2. The teachers are not interested in teaching in villages. The teacher, who is very much bothered about giving the best education to his/her child in a big town, is not at all bothered about the rural children.

Gayatri Devi: (Professor of ELI, Director, Regional Institute of English, South India, Bangalore)

1. When you look into reality, culture can't be taught as separate subject. It is already given into the curriculum. We must see how much of it is achieved now. Yes, I believe we must give something externally.
2. There should be universal access to learning music. Drama has a pedagogical value in the classroom. Therefore, theatre in Education becomes a popular strategy in the system. When a child is asked to do role play, it communicates without tension.
3. Every teacher has to undergo 20 days of compulsory training under SSA. We need to use this opportunity to train them properly.

4. It's time we questioned some of the practices in our culture like animal sacrifice, women as equal co-citizen.

5. If we say spiritual is religion, we won't develop rationalism in children.

   Story telling is lost with the break up of joint family system. There is no grandma to tell the story. It's also a big mistake to have removed the supplementary reader. There is no opportunity for students to read extra stories. We must bring it back. We are not developing thinking ability in a particular language. Children pass examination, that is all.

**Meera Nayak : (Chairperson, Samata, A Feminist organisation)**

Quality of the teacher matters. It's he or she who shapes the child in the classroom. We can't have archaic texts which still say Raghava is right who deserts his wife on the allegation made by a washerman. Textbook committee should be of high quality. It has people of mediocrity. She expressed her fear about the cultural problem in education being reduced to including a lesson as it happened in the case of Ambedkar's thoughts or environmental education.

The committee expressed its serious anguish about the way we are educating our children. It looks as though we are educating them to export to foreign countries. The NCERT itself doesn't have a course in languages and humanities subjects. They have been abolished.

The Chairman made these introductory remarks:

When the child learns to read and write, it should be able to read whatever books are available on the subject written for children. So, I am going to say that a library should be an important component of every school and the library should have alternative books easily readable by the students and the examination should not be memory oriented. Children should be able to take these assignments more joyfully than they do now, more creatively than they do now and an assessment should mean not merely the assessment of the students but also is an assessment of how well the teachers have taught. So assessment is not just measuring the students but finding out how well we have been able to communicate to the students. The whole meaning of assessment should change. All these are going to be taken up by other groups, which are going into the whole business of school education. Taking for granted that these changes take place, hopefully, we should be able to say how we can impart some cultural values. I tell you, in the very first meeting, one of the writers whom I deeply respect, a great writer of this country, Mahasweta Devi said that the art of story telling is now disappearing. When there were extended families, some old person would tell children stories, and children could also narrate some stories.

Now, if story telling disappears altogether, she thought that it would be a disaster for many things. Story telling, then, is an art to be inculcated and whether story telling can become a medium through which music, drawing, theatre ….. etc, can come into in the art like story telling? That is a question I would like to be examined.

The second one, something that I deeply believe in and many of us in the committee believe in, that the common schools were a great source of learning in the country for a long time and slowly they are ceasing to be so.
The whole problem is this: we are a secular country, but when we bring in culture; it necessarily brings in a lot of religious concepts, religious imageries and religious idioms have even- integrated in our languages... There was even a feeling that we should leave culture out in school education so that we keep the secular ideas. I think Prof. G.H. Nayak in Mysore was also saying this.

N S Raghunath Head, DESSH, RIE, Mysore. He coordinated both Mysore and Bangalore meetings: He summed up the important points of Mysore meeting.

URA May I ask some people to initiate discussion? Rajashekar Mansoor is a great singer himself and also a retired Professor of English. I would like to ask you this question, which came up in our discussion: “If we start teaching children the ragas as you do, they may even run away from you. How do we develop a musical sense for general students in common schools without that kind of a classical, old style? There may be special students who opt to learn classical music, but I am not thinking of them...

Rajashekar Mansoor: (Retired professor of English and an eminent exponent of Hindustani music) At the school level, I believe, we can make music or other fine arts compulsory, not as a subject but as a matter of encounter, without examination, from 1st standard to 7th standard, exposing them to music, dance, painting, whatever. We can have from 1st Std to 3rd Std one stage; 4th to 6th, second stage; and 7th in itself as a stage. The idea is to expose students to fine arts. For this, I feel, it is not necessary that young children should necessarily learn the ragas, because it is very difficult for children to appreciate the system of ragas. What can be done is, just expose them to music, classical or folk, dance, painting, etc. If this continues for 7 years, after the 7th Std, there could be an optional subject, if they show interest—whether they learn it as performers or whether they learn to appreciate the music, both are important. So, after the 7th Std, they can have one of the arts as an optional subject in lieu of some other subject, which they can be left out. It seems to me that long ago, in some schools we used to have what was then called a culture-day every week—I am talking about Mysore. I have a friend who attended some primary school there. He told me that long ago, some 20-25 years ago, they used to have Saturday as a culture-day, no classes, only music, dance, drawing, etc. We can invite artists to perform there like the SPIC MACAY has been doing. When you
invite various artists to give some kind of a lecture demonstration to the students, it would help the students. Also, we can have workshops in fine arts for those students who are really interested.

**Mrs Shashi Deshpande (A well known Indian novelist in English):** Firstly, it seems to me to speak of cultural values' is rather problematic. Since the word culture itself is liable to misuse and misinterpret as we have seen in the past. It therefore seems to me that the word ‘creativity’ or the creative arts’ could become more meaningful and relevant, specially when we think of the context of the needs of the children. During the meeting many spoke of the ‘culture’ again becoming a structured and textbook oriented part of a school syllabus. To speak of ‘creativity’ would mean side-stepping this hazard. It also mean an exposure to, an understanding of, the creativity of humans in various folds, which can be explored thorough the creativity of the children themselves. Which is what will allow them to get in touch with the best and the most exciting part of humans as well as their own selves.

Speaking of literature, while an exposure to literature can provide children with both aesthetic and intellectual values, as well as an understanding of humans I seems to me that literature cannot be read without proper understanding of language and of its use Therefore an understanding of language and of use has to come first. Language can be learnt looking at the way it has been used by writers., which will mean that children will be allowed to participate in a discovery of how words are used – which in turn will lead them into literature.

If one is to understand culture as being as most civilized relationship between humans, a sensitivity to and an understanding of those considered ‘others’ is important. This is the only way of destroying prejudices, which is the beginning of the most uncultured behaviour. Gender sensitivity specially seems to me to be something that has necessary to be part of my value system that children have to absorb. It is only of the most important ways of improving relations between the two genders therefore of human relation in general.

We need to have a panel of artists, writers, etc, who will be willing to participate in any programmes for schools, and these panels are specially needed for government schools,. For rural schools and all other schools which the less privileged children attend. These people will be on tap, so to say, for any plan
that may call for their cooperation.

Finally, while we are all aware of the vast numbers of any programme for school in India would involve and of the enormous lacunae in most matters, even the very basic infrastructure, as also the various obstacles and handicaps, both natural and human-made, it is still necessary to make plans which will improve the quality of education. And learning about human creativity being a major ingredient of better education in terms of shaping a better human being, such ideas should and can eventually be part of every plan to improve school education. These ideas, which can be implemented without too much expense, will add immensely to the value of any education.

Iqbal Ahmed (an intensely creative theatre personality): We have a troupe called *Chinna Banna*. We began our performance with Animal Farm, Macbeth, Jungle Book, *Poli Kitty*. Mostly we went to villages. We gave thousands of performances. Children wanted more and more of them. We used to charge 1 rupee per child. Children used to be inspired. It’s impossible to exaggerate how inspired they were. This is what they need. If we educate children without culture, they will become corrupt doctors, engineers or corrupt IAS officers.

We have an inherent folk sense. We collected 500 folk artists and made them narrate stories. We have made them into cassettes and named it *Hakki Haadu Ogatina Rani*. In the olden days, grand parents used to tell stories and riddles. A riddle like *Cotuda Hudugi Maruda Jade* (Small Girl Long Plait, *Ans: thread and needle*) would be introduced through 3 or 4 images. We have made cassettes and books of this also. Old women in the villages can be invited and given an hour in a week on payment, of course. All forms of folk arts like songs, dances, painting can be used. A child drew a picture. It was difficult to understand what it was. I asked him. He said it was an elephant. I it didn’t look like it. It neither had the trunk nor the tail. I drew the picture of an elephant and said ‘this is an elephant’. The child said, “That is your elephant, this is my elephant.” Some of the children who are pushed to the last benches in the classroom as rowdy elements do have a different talent. They can be trained through this kind of programme. We also tried transferring stories into pictures and vice versa. Some children wrote poetry on them. That is how we can transfer the child from one genre of art to another genre of art.
Radhakrishna (an educationist): The word, ‘Samskriti’ is more important than the word ‘culture.’ Samskriti means ‘well constructed.’ What is that ‘well’? It includes a lot of ideology, goal, vision, and so on. How do we construct it? It involves methodology, pedagogy, commitment, etc.

C N Ramachandran: (A retired Professor Emeritus of English and noted literary critic in both English and Kannada) The first point is, whether we call it sensitivity or art appreciation or culture or spirituality, whatever; unless we function as pressure group in each city and village and see that our government schools are staffed in the minimum not given all the facilities. There are blackboards and toilet rooms for children—if the difference or the divide between government schools and private schools continues all our talk would be useless. All of you know that some schools are run in gentleman’s toilet rooms, urinals. If we don’t act as pressure groups, let us say, some ten people meeting once in two months in a city or a village and going to the education minister and asking him what has been done in this respect. Each year the education minister explains in the press meeting that there are 8000 teachers to be recruited and they will be recruited. For the last 8 years—I have kept a count—thousands of teachers are not recruited whereas in Vidhanasoudha not even a single clerk’s position would remain vacant for a week. Unless we do something about it as a pressure group every month, throughout the year, and bring in some parity with the government schools and the private schools, whether we like it or not, the private schools will attract all good students and the government schools will be the refuge of poor students and our talk of culture would be idle.

2... If you call it culture or sensitivity, there will be all sorts of connotations. So, let us say, Saturday or Friday, one day per week would be for extra curricular activities. On that day, the student could be asked to do variety of things, whichever he/she likes, like telling stories in about 4-5 minutes. Or he/she could collect riddles from their grandparents or he/she could tell the class something about a new plant or a new animal which she/he came to know about. That is, giving an opportunity to students to do something of their own.

3. During the long periods of vacation (either two weeks or more), all the students are given a list of books prepared by each school. Students are asked to go through them, skip through them, or glance through them, whatever. They need not study them, and are asked to write two paragraphs about each school. Some
additional points are given to the student who is acquainted with greater number of books and these points will be taken in the final grading of that student.

**Basavaraj Kalgudi: (A professor and noted literary critic in Kannada)** Some four of us formed a *Dhvani Sampanmula Kendra* (Voice Resource Centre). We adopted a school near Herohalli with an intention to set right the school text books because we felt they were of poor quality. We thought of giving some materials to prepare them before reading the Kannada and the social science books. How to give it? For instance, there is a lesson on Civilization on Sindhu River. It is a wordy and stale lesson. We invited an artisan and tried to prepare a few images like Pashupati, or a symbolic image of an animal emerging from the branch of a tree, or the ancient script of Sindhu civilization in black clay. We gave them to the school. We also gave several pictures; say for example, you have some description of Belur and Halebidu in a lesson on Karnataka Culture. We gave a 10-page booklet with illustration on many lessons. They were given free of cost. Children expressed immense satisfaction to use them.

What we felt about it is we needn’t use the word culture. Actually we didn’t use it in the past. We started using it only after we were colonized. We come to this world though our senses. Why not we take the knowledge through their sensory organs? Why can’t we adopt this one into our textbook writing? We make them sensitive to our environment through their sensory organs. In fact, what we are doing today is to alienate them from all.

**Vimala K S : (Chief Secretary, Akhila Bharata JanavadhiMahila Sanghatane, Karnataka)** Primary education is the foundation. When we think of imbibing cultural values in this backdrop, what these people are saying about infrastructure, approach, and attitude—all these become essential parts. Without a proper school building, without a playground, if we talk about syllabus and cultural values, it becomes peripheral. While addressing this issue, what Iqbal referred to earlier becomes important—there should be a cultural day once in a week. I remember that when I was in school, there was a debate competition every Friday. Whether somebody could speak or not, whether they speak for or against, whether it is for one minute or more than that, whether you read what you have written, you must participate and speak. That used to be rule. So, we need to have some such activity, which can expose the talent or ability.
Storytelling is really important, but it just eroded. When look at the primary school texts one thing comes to my mind. We have festivals, which have different phases and meanings. In lessons about festivals, however, we have surface level information. For instance, Deepavali is about burning crackers, having new clothes, and eating sweets. When we describe Deepavali as a festival of lights there is a deep-rooted meaning behind it. Also, everything is urban oriented. If we can focus on rural values also, what we have as pluralistic culture (which is dwindling away), co-existence, janapara and janapada values, if we can cultivate these things at a primary level, it can definitely create a wonderful society.

M V Nadakarni (Professor emeritus of Political Science, Runs a Center for Sociology Developmental Studies): I would like to take a little broader perspective, maybe a little historical perspective and then come to the subject. I will speak from the point of view of development. In the beginning stages of history, development was culture-driven. Much before European Renaissance, we had this culture-driven development in India, Greece, and even in Karnataka in the form of architecture, literature and so on. I include literature in culture development along with architecture and music. Later on, of course, after industrialization, we had this factory-driven development. Then, we have had the service-driven development—marketing, banking, etc. Later we had knowledge-driven development. Now we have reached a stage where there are multiple drives, not a single drive, to development. In a situation like this, what is the objective of schooling?

Suresh Kumar: (Additional Secretary to the govt. of Kerala in the Science and technology department) He has also served as the educational sector for quite some time:

The first thing has already been said by Prof. Mansoor himself. Up to class 4, the whole teaching learning process in “Kali Nali” involves a lot of role-play, singing, dancing, situations where children’s creativity is consciously encouraged. The tough challenge is to equip the teachers to do that; we are talking about the entire state. As you rightly pointed out, nothing of these capabilities are inculcated in teachers through the regular BEd courses. So, we have to look at how this can be done. We discovered that we needed help from professionals, help from practicing artists and eminent people like that. We also found that there is quite a lot of intelligence and creativity in the teacher himself/herself. We have
to trigger it off, to create situations where they can come forward. One of the things we discovered early is that there is certain basic grammar of these creative arts. For instance, every teacher cannot be or should not be made into a classical singer, but the basics of music such as melody, rhythm, etc., every teacher can be equipped with. This was a great challenge. We expected every child to be involved in this sort of situation right from class I and the teacher also needs to know how to get the children to do a group song or how to design a play involving children.

T K Joshi (a Practicing primary teacher in Malapur, Kerala) We are discussing about culture, but in Kerala it has created problems. Schools are divided into groups—Hindu schools, Muslim schools, and Christian schools. The participation and enrolment of students in common schools are getting diminished. That is a major problem in the field of culture and we have to face it.

I feel that the library every school should have a collection of the best paintings, the best music and the best literature. Every teacher should be able to introduce these to the children and tell them in which context each painting was done, what are the techniques used, and why it is a masterpiece. Thus, familiarization with creative arts begins. Here too, we have to be cautious: How do we select the top ten? How do we equip every teacher to appreciate creative arts? There are the challenging questions, but I guess, these will have to be done.

We must remind ourselves here that it is not easy for a teacher to do all these things unless there is a system which supports and provides the inputs continuously. The teacher is anyway busy with non-academic things like human census, animal census, all kinds of election work. So, the support from the system is very important.

URA: I am asking the Sahitya Academy to get involved. If that happens, you are looking after the whole region—Karanataka, Kerala, and Tamil Nadu. You can speculate how writers coming under Sahitya Academy can make some inputs into it.

Raghunath: If the noted writers agree to meet the children for readings sessions, or whatever, let them have them in rural areas rather than in big cities.

Agrahara Krishnamurthy, (Regional Secretary of Central Sahitya Akademy in Bangalore): I will focus on that later on, but to begin with, I agree with
Shashiji, about not to call it as a culture lesson; definitely, that misleads. What we learnt during our school days was craft, moral lessons, and clay modelling. It was not one class in a week, but one period everyday meant for extracurricular activities. My humble submission is that in every language there are certain time-tested texts available. For example in Kannada, *Koluru Kodagusina Kathe*, or *Govina Hadu* or *kalabeda kolabeda, husia nudiyalu beda* are classics not to be left out of the reading material for the child. These have been compulsory every year for centuries in a cultural context. These are the texts, which any culture should keep on reading.

**URA:** Education was valued very highly by all the backward classes because they could overcome their backwardness only through education. A great poet in my language, Kuvempu, who comes from a rural, rich vokkaliga family, but not very literate says, “What saved me was the 26 letters of the English alphabet. It took me away from the life in Kottige (cattleshed).” That’s symbolic; there may be a little exaggeration, but it is true that education meant changing your status. Certainly, for Dalits, it was, and it is still so—it helped them in moving into a higher level of society. This is the reason behind the rush for private schools. Positively, they rush to private schools, because parents feel that if their children learn to speak English well, unlike them, they will come up in life. This feeling is strongly there in many parents. All of us who want to do anything new have to work within this environment, because you cannot take away that basic urge for learning; it comes from a desire for better life; there is no point in evading that. If we want to face that, we will have to make experiments. The example you gave of that school is that they are good in learning. They have been successful, because their local cultures were accepted in the process of learning. Still, you used all the local cultures to take them out of the local culture, to take them into a higher level. We have been doing this even with the tribes. We all say that we appreciate the tribal culture, so that the tribes begin to learn; so that they can be taken away from their culture. There is this fundamental sad problem in all of us. We should also know how to tackle it. So using their local culture is only a strategy for us; whereas for them, who have lived like that for thousands of years, there is a value in it, they like it for its own sake, but we use it to take them out. This should bother us.
Suresh: We have to generate an environment where every culture is respected. I remember a small incident, which happened last month. We had a workshop in Trivandrum where we were developing textbooks. In the evenings we brought different types of visitors who would have a formal interaction with the participating teachers. One evening, we brought a tribal man from Kasargod. He was particularly interesting, because he was one person who had deliberately evaded the literacy movement and he had his reasons. He said, “In the darkness of the jungle I can see the glow of an eye and I can tell you whether it is a deer or a tiger. After you teach me akshara, you draw a picture of an eye and ask me to write, ‘kannu’.” So, they have their own knowledge system.

URA: So there is something profoundly sad about education.

A lady: It is about this urbanization and education which actually make people distrust. If you go to a village there is so much trust and bonding among children which we do not see among urban children.

Suresh: The original idea, we will keep out of rote memorization and evolve alternate pedagogies. The reason would be that this would also give you the space for building in other hidden elements in the curriculum—group activities, respect for elders, etc.

URA: People like you and Unni who have worked with this kind of environment, even if you bring them into our world, there is something that has happened to you, you are no longer sure of this world. So, working with the tribes is a value in itself because we lose some of our absoluteness that we know everything. It makes you humble sometimes. There should be some kind of learning on our side also. If tribal children and our children go to the same school, there can be some kind of learning for our children as well. That doesn’t happen now—you have muslim schools, tribal schools, Christian schools, you have special schools. Children do not learn from one another.

The lady: One of the suggestions that recently came up from somebody here is that there should be community schools in each area. Children should be made to go to schools from that area. That forces parents from different classes, religions and castes to actually take an interest in that school within that community. I think we should work towards that.
Raghunath: All schools must meet parents once in a month. There should be a parent-teacher interaction; it will bring the school closer to community. Unfortunately it is not happening; in DM school it is abandoned completely.

Man from Kerala: The problem is, parents are dropping out of such meetings. In Tayani a majority of the population are tribes. The parents are not willing to attend the PTA meeting. The reason being, whenever such a meeting takes place the teacher is pointing at them, “your children or your child are/is not doing well.” No parent wants to hear something unpleasant about his/her child. Every time this particular community is blamed in presence of other people from other community, they feel insulted.

Raghunath: The mistake lies with the teachers here. Teaching community needs to be sensitized about it. They must meet the parents periodically..

Niranjan Aradhya (Research Officer National Law school of India University): Many of the things that you are discussing are happening daily. We all know, especially middle class and upper middle class people that even in good schools where we send our children nothing is happening; still, we are sending our children. But while addressing a different audience, we criticize govt schools in such a way that parents will certainly have a negative opinion. This results in parents, whose children have not attended schools for ages, deciding that they should not send children to government schools. This is a very dangerous thing; we will have to be conscious of it. I will be very happy if you make this as an important conviction in your report. Secondly, the experiment that is taking place in community schools in Karnataka is a wonderful thing. We took a decision after Rajaramanna Committee recommendation that parents of school going children must play a decisive role in the entire schooling process. At the time of planning, execution and evaluation. As a result of that, all 55,000 schools across the state have SDMCs. When we talk about SDMCs and point to the fact that parents do not come here, we should not send a negative signal. After SDMCs have come, parents started going to school and started observing if the teacher is punctual. The whole amount of construction Rs, 50,000 that used become 30,000 by the time it came through ZP and TP, that amount that is being used in schools now is 1, 5500. Communities are also donating; according to the statistics within the education department show us that within three years, there were about 90 crores in different schemes. I think we must acknowledge that.
completely agree with Prof. URA. that there is an urgent need to send positive signal about the entire system in spite of various problems. One single demand from all of us is to implement the recommendations of Kothari Commission recommendation of 1966. There is no single commission like Kothari Commission—except the commissions in medical and legal education systems—that has studied comprehensively the problems of education. Kothari Commission is the Bible for education. This is the time for us to take a firm stand to raise the basic issues under your leadership where UPA is making all kinds of tall promises—we must demand one common school system and minimum of ten years school education to all children. Eight years’ school education is outdated when we are talking about globalization.

The government system will have to undergo a radical change. The philosophy of governance, the management policy of governance, whether the department of education can be an autonomous body, almost non-governmental, and each district can be organized as district body where public participation is more. There are betterment committees, but I do not know the result out of them. True culture should be definitely secular; there cannot be any different opinion about that. Unless a school becomes a community school, I am afraid, we cannot include storytelling, kamsale, dollu kunitha and other fine arts.

• We use education to fulfill our Constitutional obligations like JUSTICE, LIBERTY among all FRATERNITY. Therefore, compulsory mass education in a time bound programme is the need of the hour. The challenge between the civil society and enlightened individuals is to transform these schools into functional quality community learning institutions in the near future.

• The new process of integrating cultural values in school education and make our children to question critically the present development models economic, political and social systems. These cultural values should be drawn from the Constitution and other international human rights treaties.
• We need to recognize that the development of common school system to be a very vital component for securing social justice and equity in school education as recommended by Education Commission under the chairmanship of Dr D S Kothari. The National Policy on Education in 1968 accepted the recommendation of Kothari Commission for bringing about the common school system. Later the National Policy on Education Review Committee put forth the concrete steps to translate the concept into reality and suggested that as the first step towards achieving the common school system, the existing government, local body and government aided school have to be transformed into such neighborhood schools. But even today the common school system remain a concept. We need to launch a social movement for demanding the implementation of common school system. The new common school system would bridge the cultural barriers by bringing all students together irrespective of caste, creed, location, or sex to have access to education of comparable quality. This would be the real and natural integration of cultural values in to school education and more precisely into the living classrooms.

The issue of equitable quality education is finally brought to the forefront of school education debates in India. It is recognized that the quality of school education cannot be seen in isolation. It is in this context the integration of cultural values into the curriculum of school education is of paramount importance.

• Too much control and bureaucratization of schools is anti thesis for integration of cultural values and creativity. Our experiences shows that wherever schools have been subjected to rigid control, it results in spoon feeding (trainings), lack of motivation and innovation on the part of teachers on the contrary, freedom to plan their own activities boosts the morale of teachers. It provides lot of space for teachers to use local resources and experiences to make classroom transactions more effective and meaningful. In my opinion, a reasonable democratic space for teachers to plan their day-to-day learning activities gives
more space for integration of cultural values at the school level. Teachers must plan for a cultural library in each school consisting of local games, folklore, riddles, stories etc to expose children to variety of cultural practices. Teachers should be called as cultural ambassadors of particular village/ward.

- Cluster Resource Center at the cluster level should function as supportive institution to schools in terms of dissemination of information to strengthen the cultural richness at the local level by providing wide cultural experiences and resources to classroom teachers. The contents and methodologies of cultural values should be part and parcel of teacher training institutions. In the first step the cultural integration could be achieved by integrating cultural values in teaching subjects like Language Environmental Science and Arithmetic. However it is not an end in itself. Opportunities should be given to students to take each subject of fine arts as separate discipline in the later stage. Teachers must be sensitive enough to identify students potential beyond subjects like Language, Science, Mathematics and other general subjects to nurture the genuine hidden talent of students for music, art, painting, singing, dance etc. The role of District Institute of Education and Training (DIET) and state Directorates of Education Research and Training (SERTs) is of paramount importance

**URA:** When we had the first meeting of the CABE, a retired director of IIT said something, which was very important. He said that when he was the director, many of the students who came to do IIT were from common schools, that they had a variety of talents in IIT, but now the talent coming into IIT had dropped. They are all from the upper classes, go to private English medium schools and they know how to pass these exams, because they are trained to pass these exams by private tuition homes from class I. They come to IIT and he said the IIT quality has suffered because they were not drawing from the whole mass of people. We asked what we should do. Some of them, the elite people said, “let us have some reservation at IIT for students coming from common schools.” Another suggestion came—let the entrance test be conducted in such a way that those who come from common school can pass through it. Now, you have a testing
which is so in built with the kind of input from private education that only those who attend such schools can tackle those questions. So, change the type of question papers. We used to have a Lekak contest in Karnataka, I was a part of the contest. I used to be one of the people to interview the top students. I began to ask them about Shivaram Karanth. The very next year I found that all of them had read about Kannada literature because they knew that some questions will be asked. I asked a student from Mysore about the statue of Mysore ajja, the statue of Tatayya. So, they begin to acquire knowledge in such areas. We have a middle class, which is hungry for success and we all belong to that. Hence we have work these new ideas within that kind of a framework and fight for it. M.T. Vasudevan Nair told me when I used to work for the Kerala education, “I am a writer in Malayalam, because I went to a common school. My children who go to a private school will never be writers in Malayalam.” You may come from any class, but when you go to a common school, you meet children from other castes and classes sitting along with you. Now we don’t have it; it is worse than caste system. We have another caste now, and your children grow with that kind of notion. We have completely sacrificed those values which made a kind of a society possible.

Unnikrishnan: We have to look at the medium of instruction, because I cannot express my culture in English.

Raghunath: I wonder if there is a second opinion about whether the medium of instruction up to 6th or 7th standard should be the regional language.

The lady: I want to comment on that. Why regional language, why not optional language?

Raghunath: There is no doubt about that. English as a language should be taught, but not as a medium of instruction. It can’t become medium of culture.

Sheela Gowda (A Visual Artist): I wanted to raise one issue. The burden on a school going child starts very early, the moment they are 3 years they are actually going for tuitions, they are writing not only in school but also after the school hours. This is from private schools and not necessarily from govt schools. Because of sheer pressure and competition about the performance of their children, parents are confused about putting their children in a particular school. If we want to remove this prior pressure on parents and children, I think there
should be some legislation that children should not be taught to write until the age of 6 at least.

**URA:** We are very unscientific about even in that. If you learn English alphabets at an early age, you cannot learn to read, because English is not a scientific language. You have to know the word in order to read it, whereas Kannada, Malayalam, Tamil and Telugu are scientific languages, phonetics. If you learn the alphabet you can read. Our parents think that their children should be taught A, B, C, and D from the first standard, which is useless. They can learn how to speak English, because the language of power now, but why should they learn how to read and write.

**Sheela:** As stated by Shashi Deshpandey, it is more appropriate to use the term ‘Creative Learning Instead of Culture’. There are some basic points to be noted:

Creative means are employed by the teacher to teach general subjects like math, science and so on. The Creative Arts as a subject: These should be introduced to children after the age of about 12 years (from high school): for example a child should be able to take up the learning of music, or Painting as a main subject as one would a science or Math subject. The teaching of these would mean specialised teachers need to be employed; the logistics for this need to be investigated. Till the age of awakening all the senses of the child to become aware of the world around and to develop an independent, questioning and sensitive mind should be the goal of la school curriculum.

Some thoughts on schooling and ideas on creative learning: It is important to set aside one day in a week for relative activities. Friday would be ideal because it is followed by another half day of school so there is no temptation to treat this aspect of learning too casually. The existence of many kinds of art forms indicates that an experience, an emotion, a narrative, as expressed in one art form, cannot be adequately translated into another. It is important to state here that the verbal has been privileged too much for too long. Verbal interpretation and expression has dominated the method of teaching in schools. Acknowledging that there is an urgent need to improve visual sensitivity at the school level is crucial to setting right this imbalance.

Some ideas: The school building and surroundings itself has to become an object of creative expression. With common everyday materials, a teacher can
inspire the children to change its appearance. For example the outer walls of the schools could become the sight for murals. Simple materials like mud, cow dung could be used to make a fun experience and the resulting mural a joyful visual statement. Waste pieces of cloth can be stitched collectively, to make a quilt, which can be used by the children in classroom work. Quilt making is a folk tradition in most villages. The art of making one, as a child, could also serve as an economic option later.

Most children in villages are familiar with folk forms of puppetry, which employ story telling, music, and performance. It would be a mutually benefiting experience if folk parishioners of puppetry could be invited to help the children make simple puppets which they could then use in a skit, weaving in stories and music of their own. Funds for these activities should include a basic remuneration for the folk artists. National materials like twigs, fibre from coconut trees, could be options for making puppets as would be haldi, kumkum, lime and other natural, vegetable colours.

Robust performances on the Dollu as in ‘Dollu Kunitha’ acrobatic dances as in ‘Kamsale’, rhythmic dance movement as in ‘Kolata’ are definitely preferable to the ‘drill’ as performed in most schools. This culturally meaningless and physically uninspiring ‘sport’ needs to be eliminated from schools. Children should be taken on school trips, once a year at least, to nearby sites of archaeological and cultural importance which can become a lesson in history and culture.

Every village has within it or in the neighboring villages some historic relics. Students should be encouraged to investigate and write about things around them in addition to studying the meanings and origin of rituals and social practices in their village. Visual documentation of these through drawings leads to better observation. Encourage a student to pick up interesting elements such as a feather, a special stone, a piece of broken sculpture, a leaf from the environment and display it in class, would lesson the dullness of a classroom. An expert panel should be propose a carefully selected set of books which should be compulsorily kept in every government school. These books should pertain to all forms of art, and should contain good illustrations and simple text. They should encompass the period from ancient art to the contemporary. General picture books related to culture should also be included. These would be useful reference books for
teachers and would give a clue to the student that art as a form of expression can be taken up as a profession (I, as a professional artist today, did not know till I had passed out of school land joined an art school near my house, that visual art is a language and that it can be learnt and there are various professions possible through this learning!)

It is heartening to note that it is mainly in Government schools that trained drawing teachers are employed. It has been so since many years. However, the training of these teachers need urgent reviewing. Only Diploma/Degree holders in visual arts with an additional course in art teaching should be appointed. At the moment the teachers have the option of becoming drawing teachers after only 2 years of training which is inadequate in experience and exposure. The Lalith Kala Academy should be involved in making the syllabus of the art teacher training course more dynamic.

Students and teachers should visit museums and temporary exhibitions. This is not always possible due to the remoteness of many villages from these. The Karnataka Lalitha Kala Academy, for example has a van specially equipped to take art exhibitions to the people. This is a good idea but makes the viewers into passive recipients. For it to be effective and meaningful it needs to tie up with schools in villages. It should be accompanied by a programme that makes it interactive. The Lalith Kala Academy needs to look into this exciting possibility.

The success of ideas to motivate a child to become a more imaginative and sensitive being rests on the teacher's understanding of the concept behind it. As professionals in our respective fields it is fairly easy to generate ideas but a teacher in a village/urban government school has to be guided and assisted in these activities initially.

A panel of professionals from all creative fields, should be put together to generate ideas. These should be explained, through teacher training camps and through kits, to the teachers who are going to implement them. The concept and method of the activity should be clear so that the teachers understand why they are doing what they doing so that it doesn’t degenerate into a meaningless and joyless ritual or habit. These panel members should be sensitive to the nuances of the region's culture and its potential in creative learning. It is important to remember
that folk culture, like other cultures, is not homogeneous and a folk form from one region can be alien to another.

It is of course important to review the suggested ideas themselves after getting a feedback on implementation. Teachers should not be any more burdened with the job of doing extra work which does not pertain to the school like census taking etc. A tired and overworked teacher cannot be creative and dynamic.

It is extremely distressing to see that now a child, which starts to go to pre-school as early as 2½ years, is being made to read and write at this age. The pre-school years are crucial for the child to look, feel, touch and experience the world in a gentle manner. These experiences shape; its potential to respond sensitively later in life. No amount of creative learning later in life is going to make up for the lack of this experience early in life. Though the urban and small town private schools and what is happening in these are not the focus here I would like to point out that they are setting examples, mostly bad ones to the parents of those children going to Government schools. In fact many parents take their children out of government schools because they feel these schools are not teaching ‘enough’ to the young ones. Considering there is so much peer pressure to make the child read and write so early, only legislation will stop this violence on the child.

Through Legislation no school, private or otherwise, should be allowed to make the child write before the age of 6.

Neighbourhood schools should be set up both in rural and urban areas. All children coming under the jurisdiction of a certain marked area should be compulsorily make to attend the school in that are only. This is a feature that exists in western countries, for example in Switzerland. When parents of all class and religion are forced to send their children to the neighbourhood school there will be an effort on their part to be involved with these schools. This can be implemented gradually from Standard I upward. Children going to neighborhood schools would have the advantage of not having to travel far and to grown up as a community. No parent would find the need to send their child to an expensive private school if the neighbourhood school fulfils its purpose of providing a meaningful education.

**URA.** What I suggest is, if there is some kind of an assessment, it should be an assessment of the teacher also.
Surendran, (a practicing Teacher in Kerala) I want to share some of the experiences of the KIBB some of you know, KIBB. He is a Novelist, playwright, theatre artist besides being a farmer. He was a Naxal activities. He started a school Name Kanavu it means ‘Dreams’ or Dream school, PPB he calls it, it is an alternative school. Actually he began without a curriculum. He collected some fifty tribal dropouts from Wynad district including his two children. (Now four of them are studying in England.) They are backward in all activities. They were backward in learning languages as well as other subjects. He taught them dances and their folk songs and he allowed these children to speak in their own languages. At the same time he taught them English, Hindi, and Malayalam as well. First, he didn’t introduce Reading and writing only discussion. He practice the Cavery pita, pottery, Agriculture and some nature conservation activities in His main activity in the morning was Cavery pita and in the afternoon practiced their own dance. They have now performed in many parts of the country and built up their own funds.

Sheija from Prajayathna: We have been with children addressing children rights for ten years now. What I am going to share here is based on Experience working with hundred schools across Eight districts. Within a period of three to six months children would dropout from the Government schools. On probing we discovered that most schools run in slum areas and villages have absolutely no infrastructure at all. What I would like to share with you here is our experience to putting children back to schools through non-formal education. We enrolled hundreds of them for three to six months. They are now back in school. The team of community members were trained by experts in child centered learning and joyful learning, and so on.

We are discussing here how we can integrate culture, whether it is culture or creative arts. We have to considered 90 Lakh children who are going to 5,5000 Government schools in Karnataka. So whatever kind of approach that we need to adopt, we need three lakh teachers. Do we have them? Interestingly, there are a lot of experts in various fields, whether it is story telling or story writing or whether it is Yakshagana or Folk arts forms, we must involve them.

Only one serious observation to make: This entire process should be more realistic and practical. I completely agree with you like we have to see these subjects as an end in themselves. It’s not really a means to teach some other
subjects. More subjects for teaching turns our attention on teaching faculty. There are about 25,000 lower primary schools. But in many schools there are only two teachers and absolutely no infrastructure.
Annexure 4

Minutes of the Meeting of the Sub-Committee of CABE on the subject of “Integration of Culture Education in the School Curriculum” held on 31.3.2005 in the Committee Room, Zakir Hussain Block, First Floor, NCERT

The second meeting of the sub-committee of CABE on the above subject was held on 31.3.2005. The following members attended the meeting:

1. Prof. U. R. Ananthamurthy  
   Chairperson  
   498 Suragi, HIG House  
   RMV IInd Stage, 6th A Main  
   Bangalore - 560 094

2. Shri Javed Akhtar  
   Member  
   702 Sagar Samrat  
   Green Field  
   Juhu, Mumbai – 400049

3. Ms. Shubha Mudgal  
   - do -  
   39-B, MIG Flats, Motia Khan  
   Paharganj, New Delhi

4. Ms. Krishna Sobti  
   - do -  
   505-B, Purvasha  
   Anand Lok Housing Society  
   Mayur Vihar, Phase – I  
   Delhi – 110091

5. Shri Vinod Raina  
   - do -  
   C/O Bharat Gyan Vigyan Samiti  
   YWA Hostel No.2  
   G Block, Saket  
   New Delhi- 110017

6. Dr. Kiran Seth  
   - do -  
   Associate Professor  
   Production & Industrial Engg.  
   IIT  
   New Delhi- 110016

7. Ms. Anshu Vaish  
   - do -  
   Principal Secretary, School Education  
   Government of Madhya Pradesh  
   Vallabh Bhawan  
   Mantralaya  
   Bhopal-462004
Prof. Krishna Kumar, Director, NCERT as the Member Secretary of the Sub-Committee welcomed all the members. He once again drew the attention of the members to the terms of reference of the committee for introducing culture education in the school and teacher education curriculum. The Director pointed out that the time limit of the committee to give its recommendations is already over. He also informed the group that the next meeting of the Central Advisory Board of Education (CABE) will be held sometime in the fourth week of May, 2005. In view of this, he requested the Chairman of the Committee, Prof. U R Ananthamurthy to submit the final report before the proposed meeting of the CABE. The Director also complimented Prof. Ananthamurthy for preparing a preliminary report based on discussions and deliberations with the experts in the area of culture education.

Prof. Ananthamurthy mentioned that the terms of reference of the committee focus on development of awareness, appreciation and skills related to art and culture. Therefore, art should not be introduced as a separate subject up to class VIII. Instead, only general awareness about various forms of art should be provided to the children. For this, schools can allocate a few periods exclusively for exposure to art. He also informed the members that the initiatives taken by the government of Karnataka to introduce art as a separate subject in the initial years of schooling had to be withdrawn because of the heavy curriculum.

Prof. Ananthamurthy also pointed out that local cultural practices should be known to children and alienation from these should not take place. Children may be exposed to art without any pressure of evaluation. The children poor in achievement could be sometimes good in creative arts. Music and art training is becoming expensive, if it is available at the school level, many children may opt it. Discussions related to art and music may be
initiated at the school level so that children could develop discriminatory skills. A sacred book may be written about every culture and it may be made available in all languages so that all children could have access to at least one sacred book.

During the ensuing discussion, a question was raised regarding the aims of culture education and there was a consensus among members that the culture education is expected to make children good human beings, more open and more sensitive. In this context, it was pointed out that culture should not be treated as something different from life. Films are a part of life for children, it is a way of telling stories. Therefore, it is important that children discuss and develop discernment about films. Listening to the film songs could also lead to understanding of 'ragas'. Teachers need training and sensitivity to guide students for awareness and appreciation of art and culture. Cultural identities need to be encouraged but these should not come in conflict with citizenship. It was clarified by the Chairman that culture refers to ordinary man’s lifestyle, not an elitist orientation towards arts. Students need to identify art with whatever they are doing in their day-to-day life, especially in a diversified cultural environment of India. Culture is learned from various sources and in different settings. Simply teaching of arts at school level may not influence learning of art and culture. Teachers need to be trained to tackle cultural diversity in classrooms. It is important for children to know the diverse Indian languages, cultural traditions etc. which will help them know their own cultural roots and develop respect for others.

It was pointed out that information about different cultures may form a part of the language textbooks. All art forms need to be given respectability and legitimacy by giving them prominence by including them in various publications and making them visible in the libraries. NCERT and CIET can play a major role in this direction. SCERTs and DIETs need to have a unit on art education. The grants for books and material on art education are not utilised as materials are not available locally. There is a need to create a bank of songs, stories etc. in schools. Basic materials on art education could be telecast through EDUSAT. Teachers may be trained to use media-related educational technology.

Recommendations for introducing art appreciation as an elective subject in the universities was also made by the Sub-Committee. Social science curriculum may also include content on awareness of culture, art and music.

Ministry of Information and Broadcasting, Government of India may be sensitised to broadcast programmes in line with the recommendations of this committee. Officials from the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting could be invited in the next meeting to have greater acceptability of the recommendations.

The Chairman also requested the members to give their feedback on the preliminary draft report to him through fax/e-mail. He also suggested that a letter should be sent to Secretary, Department of Culture Education of each
State/UT for a report on the status of art and music schools and colleges. Prof. Ananthamurthy requested the Director, NCERT to extend the tenure of secretarial assistance presently being provided to him by RIE, Mysore till the finalisation of the report. It was also suggested that a consultation may be held on 10th May, 2005 at Bangalore. He requested the members to send names and addresses of experts for this meeting. Director, NCERT mentioned that the Additional Secretary, MHRD will be requested to extend the tenure of this committee till the finalisation and submission of the report i.e. third week of May, 2005. He also informed that the final report of the committee will be put on the NCERT website for wider dissemination.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair and the members of the Committee.
Suggestions from Shri Javed Akhtar, Member

1. The child must be given on hand experience of the culture of the region: folklore, folk music, arts and crafts, food, architecture, dialects.
2. The formal curriculum must have stories/poetry from different languages of India.
3. Art, music, drama, craft and gardening must form a part of the curriculum with emphasis on letting children choose what they enjoy doing or are good at. The child must be exposed not only to the traditional, “high” art and music but also to the popular and the modern streams.
4. It is important that children become aware of cinema both as an art form and means of communication. (If the idea is considered to sophisticated, it may be shifted to senior secondary school)
5. There must be some exposure of the child to world art, literature, music, architecture, food and other cultural activities.
6. The course content and methodology must be devised by teachers, and ideally, should vary from school to school and region to region and from year to year. Schools should get guest faculty and take help from citizens who can help in some way. There should be discussions, excursions, workshops, camps and competitions for children round the year.
7. Time should be given for students to pursue their hobbies as part of the curriculum and the school must provide materials for students.
8. Children should be encouraged to participate in discussions, plays, music, craft and arts.
9. Workshops will have to be conduct for teachers to learn to design curricula for the purpose and to supervise various activities in the school in a structured way.
10. Some means of qualitative evaluation will have to be devised to assess students’ progress.
11. Schools will have to have materials relating to arts, crafts and architecture. There must also be a provision for music libraries.
12. The parents will have to be sensitized and be made to realize that these activities are not a “waste of time”.

Annexure 5
Suggestions from Ms. Krishna Sobti, Member

Integration and Culture – Some Thoughts

1. Combining words and ideas, defining, redefining and then combining the truth of reality with the truth of idea or thought, one has to have a profound sense of commitment to the sociology of citizenship.

2. Integration of ideas and words is rooted in the very core of culture. But political and social forces and their operators use the word to influence negative collective responses of people.

3. The moment the word “integration” or “culture” is uttered or used, it evokes conflicting responses from opposite sides – one of shrinkage within the ethnic, religious, linguistic identity, and the other of expansion by identification with the larger concepts of national/human values. That is the reason the words “integration and culture” are now a part of political vocabulary. They have lost their original meaning.

4. Tensions and conflicts of politics are diverted to the area of culture. We know that cultural diversities and traditions do not usually create those tensions that result in conflicts between different religious and regional groups that are the outcome of social tensions and are defined by political parties to their advantage.

5. To my mind, it is a crucial issue that has resulted in distortion of the impact of the concept of integration.

6. The cross cultural discourse that has been a living symbol of India’s plurality as collective consciousness is being exploited politically today, threatening the very fabric of our country’s democracy.

7. National integration and inter-state cultural communications are being turned into regionalism – unmindful of the “citizen’s culture” developed over the years.

8. In a democratic multicultural country like India, a strong common “citizen culture” which spells out the right and responsibilities, the dos and don’ts of citizens, is the need of the hour. While developing and strengthening such a citizen culture, it should be reinforced that this national citizen culture is not a threat to the different religious or regional identities or cultures, but is the common link for a unified democracy.
9. The reading material on integration should not give a feel of official publicity material. It should not be presented like syndicated material as this limits both the message and the meaning.

10. We have to create an integrated comparative text on culture, revivalism and universalism, comparing revivalism with humanism.

11. Such a text should mirror the complexity of contemporary young Indian Society – modern and post modern generations growing under the impact of global culture and contemporary civilization.

12. The very word “integration” should be internalized in the text especially designed or structured for children. For this a team of scholars and educationists, along with copywriters and advertising experts should be put together to produce the reading material for the school-going generation. To flash the meaning and message of a text such that the two are inter-linked and yet separate/are not the same, it needs the art and skill of copywriting.

13. The text prepared should portray clearly and positively “the reality of different identities”. Those others and us living together in a country like ours. India has always been recognized as having a great tradition for plurality and assimilation from all cultures.

14. The wealth of our cultural diversity is sure to give a child an idea, a vision beyond one language, one religion, one music, one literature and one culture. Plurality. Variety. And that is what Indian culture stands for.
Annexure 7

Integration of Culture Education in the School & College Curriculum:

Suggestions given by Dr. Kiran Seth, IIT Delhi
under the terms of reference of the committee

(The following has been prepared after talking to school & college students, teachers, parents, SPIC MACAY—Society for the Promotion of Indian Classical Music and Culture Amongst Youth members and others)

a. Enhancing the quality of cultural awareness among school going children:

1. Playing of classical music while children are arriving at the school for morning assembly. Also during breaks for tiffin and in residential schools during meal times in the dining hall.

2. A Virasat series (minimum 5 day long) should be conducted compulsorily by every school once a year covering different aspects of our heritage (Classical Music & Dance, Folk, Crafts, Theatre, Talks on Philosophy, Art, Literature etc., Yoga & Meditation, Walks to Heritage Sites etc.) like is being done in some educational institutions by SPIC MACAY (see attachment 1).

3. One project period per week in which students are to take a topic on some aspects of our heritage and get information about it from libraries and the internet & present it for evaluation.

4. Two minutes of 'pranayam' during assembly every day by all the students.

5. An outside inspiring input preferably once a week - could be a lecture or lecture demonstration on any aspect of the heritage (Classical Music, Dance, Art, Craft, Film classics, Philosophy, Literature, Yoga & Meditation etc.) like is being done by SPIC MACAY in some schools & colleges (see attachment 2).

6. Students should be made to stay for one month during the summer vacations with or near an inspired human being steeped in our heritage (like is being done in the SPIC MACAY Scholarship Scheme) and their experience should be evaluated (see attachment 3).

b. Ways of introducing, both in the curricular and in the extra-curricular, the learning of our traditional folk, classical and contemporary art forms:
1. From Class 1 to Class 4, one period per day should be for singing. The children should be taught simple classical compositions and folk songs. These can be identified and put into a proper syllabus.

2. From Class 5 to Class 12, Classical Music or Dance or Art (choice left to the students, but once they have made it they have to stick to it for at least 4 years) for two periods per week. A proper syllabus must be prescribed (e.g. not more than 3 ragas to be taught during the entire period). The teachers should be practitioners of the art and not just theorists. In Classical Music & Dance they should preferably be graded artistes of AIR/Doordarshan. There should be no need for them to have BA/MA degree or certificate like the Sangeet Visharad. The students should be graded and these should appear on their mark sheet.

3. Extra classes should be organised after the school hours for children who wish to opt for advanced classes.

4. A heritage Quota for admission into colleges should be introduced/increased.

c. Ways of helping the students to appreciate the world of art, music and literature:

1. Besides English & Hindi, students must be asked to take one additional language. In the more affluent schools only foreign languages are given as options. At least 50% of the languages which the children can choose from should be Indian languages.

2. At least two classical/folk concerts (preferably by professional or semi-professional artistes) must be conducted in the schools premises every year (like is being done in Norway by Rikskonsertene and by SPIC MACAY in some educational institutions) (see attachment 4).

3. From Class 1 to Class 12 one period a week for readings from our heritage should be conducted, (for example different folk tales from different parts of the country). Every student would have to make at least one presentation after reading and preparation. An attempt must be made to bring back the reading habit at least to some extent.

4. Publication of a quality quarterly magazine designed for the students, containing articles on different aspects of the heritage (like the 'EYE'-a SPIC MACAY publication) subscription to which should be encouraged (this could also be used to fulfil the requirement of point 3) (see attachment 5).

5. Software on different aspects of our heritage should be prepared (like is being done in the 'Digital Heritage Laboratory' of SPIC MACAY) and CDs should be given to the schools and students for viewing - a specific time could be allotted for this every week (see attachment 6).
6. More programmes on our heritage should be beamed through educational channels (like the 'Gyan Darshan' channel managed by IGNOU).

7. Parent Teacher Association (PTA) meetings must have a heritage component in which the importance of culture inputs in education and at home should be emphasised.

8. Students of schools and colleges must be made to attend at least one 5 day long convention per year (as is done by SPIC MACAY) in which different aspects of the heritage are showcased (see attachment 7 a & b).

d. Introducing a capsule on the appreciation of arts in the curriculum of teacher education:

1. Every potential teacher must have 2 periods a week in which they are taught Classical Music, Dance of Art. A proper syllabus is a must & grades should appear in their mark sheets.

2. One period a week must be devoted to yoga & meditation which must have its focus not only on the physical but also the mental & the spiritual aspects.

e. Introducing art appreciation as an elective subject in the universities:

1. Classical Music/Dance/Art should be introduced as an elective subject having a proper syllabus with grades, which appear on the mark sheets.

2. 100 hours of NCC or NSS or NSO is compulsory for the students to complete in many colleges. A forth option should be included: Classical Music or Dance or Art.

3. Opportunities for learning the arts after college hours should also be provided.

f. To help understand the status of art & music schools & colleges in the country:

1. A review of all art & music schools & colleges in the country by competent committees must be made which will look into the standards & then give each one of them a rating.

2. Many more teachers specialised in art, music & dance would be required if the points mentioned in a,b,c,d & e are enacted upon. The Universities Grants Commission would have to make sure that additional funding is provided for this & also that the quality of the output is maintained at a high level.
3. More government funding for independent initiatives for training young people in art & music may be provided so that many more take up these subjects as serious hobbies.

Many of the points mentioned above are already a part of the activities of SPIC MACAY. Based on its experience in the past 27 years of its existence it can also give a very positive contribution in designing & implementing the ideas mentioned in the other points.

Rikskonsertene, Norway, funded fully by the Government is an organisation with similar goals & is conducting about 9000 school programmes in Norway covering over 93% of school going children. It has a budget of about Rs.85 crores for a population of approximately 4.5 million (less than half the population of Delhi). It has a paid staff of about 50 people with its own building & infrastructure (see attachment 8).

SPIC MACAY’s budget for its 1600 events is about Rs.2 Crores. It has a paid staff of 5 people, but is run mainly by volunteers.

For implementation of the suggestions, the HRD ministry can either increase the support to SPIC MACAY or can set up a body similar to Rikskonsertene, besides, of course, taking help from the existing set up.
### Annexure 8

**Members of the CABE Committee on “Integration of Culture Education in the School Curriculum”**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Name and Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Prof. U.R. Ananthamurthy Chairman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Shri Javed Akhtar Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Ms. Shubha Mudgal Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Ms. Krishna Sobti Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Shri Vinod Raina Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Dr. Kiran Seth Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Secretary, School Education, Karnataka Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Secretary, School Education, Madhya Pradesh Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Secretary, School Education, Maharashtra Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Secretary, School Education, Uttranchal Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Secretary, School Education, Tamil Nadu Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Secretary, School Education, Assam Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Secretary, School Education, Andhra Pradesh Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Prof. Krishna Kumar, Director, NCERT Member Secretary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>